

File No. 24/28 FEA 125

File No. 24(28)-FEA/56 ~~SECRET~~

19

Collection No.

Record Permanent
'B'

Govt. of India

Min. of External Affairs

FOR OR NOT FOR NOTE BOOK

FEA Section

Pros.
Serial Nos.

D. 299-EA/57

SUBJECT

Netaji Enquiry Committee - Publications of Secret material by Sh. S.C. Bose, a member of the Committee - Desirability of taking action against him - (not to be taken).

Previous References

F. 30 (26) - FEA/55.

F. 24(25) - FEA/56.

42170

To be retained

for 5 years.

140/S/RM/95
15/11

Later References



(16) FEA/57

DECLASSIFIED

S. 97 (Unbleached).

MFP-54 General-6862-A-(C-597)-20-8-56-0,000,000

H.Katyal
5/1957



(गौतम गुप्ता)
(GAUTAM GUPTA)
उप सचिव (ए. एस. आर.एम.)
Dy. Secretary A&RM
विदेश न्यायालय, राष्ट्रीय विधानी
Ministry of External Affairs
इन्डिया

Indexed
M/W/M

SRR

947
57
S. 43

Issue Register No.

REQUISITION FOR PAPERS

Heading

Month—

Nos.

Part—

File No. 22(12)FEA/56

Collection No.

(To be filled in by Dustry.)

To be put up with— 22(16)FEA/56

Initials and date—
(Year to be given.)

Hari Dutt Katyal

1.3.1956

Signature of Dustry—
(with date of supply.)

SUBJECT (if necessary).

S.R.R.

Issue Register No.

263
57

REQUISITION FOR PAPERS.

Heading—

Month—

Nos.

Part—

File No. 22(12) FEA/56

Collection No.

(To be filled in by Duftry).

To be put up with—

F. 28(7) FEA/55

Initials and date—

(Year to be given).

Hanu Dutt Katreel
16-1-57 E A section

Signature of Duftry—

(with date of supply).

SUBJECT (if necessary).

S. 43.

M.I.P.—568 S&P—6805—(M-1118)—16-1-46—20,000 Pads.

Ministry of External Affairs
(EA Sec.)

Sub:- Dissentient Report by Shri Suresh Chandra Bose,
Member, Netaji Iking Committee. (Copy placed)

By. 299-EA/57.

(1) "Will DS(E) pl. have 'A'
below checked? 80/- PA Acharya,
24/2

(2) - Isne.

Ref. above.

~~APP & Rates~~ ^{Play W}

A list of the "Secret / Top Secret" references quoted in the "Dissentient Report" (placed on file) by Shri S. C. Bose, Member, Netaji Iking Committee, is placed below. These references are not available in EA Section. As the Committee were provided with papers from sources other than the EA Sec., the references in question were presumably taken from the papers given by the NGO. Sec. and the Min. of Defence. My my kind sir first and confirm, and also offer their comments with ref. to Min. of Home Affairs' letter at F.R.

Ans
15/1/57

US (EA)

M-R-1
191.

None of the documents (or copies thereof) is available in NGO. One page 199 of his report, Mr. Suresh Chandra Bose has stated that "I consider myself exceedingly fortunate to have succeeded in securing some top secret reports, *** *** *** and in my being able to secure a few photographs, sketches and other papers, which along with other important papers, were indispensably necessary for writing my report and which our Government have intentionally withheld from me, *** *** ***.* Prior to this statement, Mr. Suresh Chandra Bose in the penultimate paragraph of the preface of his report has stated that "It was due to some amount of resourcefulness combined with luck, that the secret reports mentioned

mentioned above together with some photographs and sketches could be got hold of." In view of this, it would seem all the more important and desirable to find out the source or the agencies from which Mr. Bose managed to secure copies of the secret and top secret documents in question. Enquiry in this respect may, however, be made in the first instance from General Shah Nawaz Khan, who was the Chairman of the Netaji Enquiry Committee.

✓
29/1/57

29/1
US(6A)

DS(E) may please see NGO's note from bottom of page 1/N. I suggest that we might refer these papers to the Ministry of Defence for their comments before we send them to General Shah Nawaz Khan, as suggested by the N. G. O. Section.

M.R. THADANI
31. 1. 1957.

DS(E)

I have glanced through the report. The quotations from the various documents which have been listed at A, which are embodied in the report do not appear to have the same secrecy today as in 1945 and 1946. The final findings of the Committee, presided over by Shri Shah Nawaz Khan, the Deputy Minister, have been placed before Parliament, but it would not surprise one if the publication of these extracts does not in any way — more than 10 years after the time — prove damaging to the security of the State. This point, however, will have to be checked with the Ministry of Defence.

2. It will be recalled that we have had one or two other questions arising out of the working of this Committee. We have been trying to retrieve two photographs which Shri Bose took away from the files sent to him as Member of the Committee. We have also had to examine as to whether we should do anything to obtain the copies of papers which Shri Bose kept from the files sent to him in Tokyo. On both, it has been decided that it would be expedient to let the matter rest rather than revive possible embers of controversy. In this connection, FS's decision in the linked file may be seen.

3. Consistent with these decisions, one would be inclined to suggest that in dealing with this publication where Shri S.C. Bose has reproduced documents which obviously were sent to him either under the specific obligation of the official secret act or on the implicit understanding that the secrecy of such official documents will not be abused, have been deliberately published. If the Defence Ministry also agrees that no serious harm can come by the publication of these reports, /...

Linked file

F24(25)-FEA/56

ph 2-3/note

F24 (25) FEA/56

Flag 'P'

it would be desirable not to take any notice and advise the Home Ministry to let the matter rest.

(J.S. Mehta)

5.2.57

JS(E) I agree. ~~before~~ F.S.'s decision at Slip P should be shown to Defence Ministry.

P-2-3/memo
F-24(25) FEA/56

595/281E

OS(F)
WS(E) MM
6/2

B.R. Acharya
572

(3) (R)

(4) Issue

D.599 EA/57

Ministry of Defence New Delhi (Shri P.D. Srivastava)
EA Ministry u.o. No. D.599-EA/57 dt. 7.2.57

See, thanks. We also agree that the ^{matter} may be allowed to rest.
D.S(A.G) has seen

to Sawant

12/3/57

② copy of the report
also placed this
place.

OS(F)

File
7/2

8/2 313-5/2/57

566-5/2/57

② 12/3/57

EA

13/3 with TWO Books

3120-5/57

M.W.C 13/3
authorised
M.W.C

Min. of E.A

566-5/2/57
13/3

Ministry of E.A.

Since the Ministry, & Deval have also agreed with this Ministry, there is, perhaps, no need to consult the Dy. Minister. ^(Suresh Chandra Bose) A draft do. letter to Shri Raj Kumar of the Home Ministry is put up with reference to DS(E); D.O. letter at SNo(4).

MV
18/4/57.

US (EA)

MR / Laddan

18/4

DS(E) M. HA may see the file with reference
to my D.O. letter ^{SNo(4)} | P.M.C.P.
18/4

R/ M. H.A (Shri Ray Kumar)

Ministry of External Affairs u/o No..... F 24 (28) FEASB 24 23/4/56

Our papers on this subject are enclosed below.

Some of the photographs and secret reports which were made available to the NETAJI Enquiry Committee by the Intelligence Bureau were published in the Dissident Report by Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, Member of that Committee.

In bringing this to our notice, the Intelligence Bureau had raised the question whether any action should be taken in this matter against the publisher & author of the Report. We referred this question to the Director of S.A. in J.S.(P.E); do letter of the 22.12.1956. The works at

X
S.No (1)

pages 3-4, which deal with this question, may be seen by I&C(F) and Secretary. Thereafter, this file will be shown to the Intelligence Bureau So.

The Min. of SA have not returned ~~the~~ Dissentient Report sent to them with I&C(F)'s off letter dated 26.4.57

Directorate -

26.4.57

Ministry of Home Affairs

* Please see
decy'd and
in the D.B.
note at back
of file under
the
copy entry 24
Date

I&C(F) b/w
27/4
(N. SAGAR)
St. Secy.

A.V. Par
D. H. P.
(A. V. Par)
Secy.

Do. 2nd b/w
27/4

Do. 2nd b/w
27/4
Please see
Gajinder Singh

Care - I'll keep copy of this relevant note for our file, which
is to be delivered to
Intelligence Bureau (Shri S.N. HOALI)

M.H.A.U.O. No. 3283/57 Roll 5 at 1/17/57

W
30/4

Dy No 2213/D

dt 2-5-57

Intelligence Bureau (MHA)

Seen, thanks. The copy of 'Dissentient Report' sent with this office U.O.No.31/DG/56, dated the 20th December, 1956 has not been received back. The same may be returned to this Bureau, for record, when no longer required.

3144

intday 14.5.57
(N.K. Ray)

Joint Deputy Director.

MHA (Shri Gajinder Singh)
DIB U.O.No.31/DG/56 dated the

D
3/5
S
M.D.A.F
4/12/57

D.2187-EA(5)

M.H.A.U.O. No.3960/57 Roll 5
dated 16/5/57

The Dir. of I&C(F) may see the I&C(F) in the Bureau, copy of the 'Dissentient Report' was sent to them with our off letter at Dno. (1) and may kindly be returned to us for transmission to the I.B. if no longer required by the Dir. -

Director of Economic Affairs (Shri M.R. THADANI)

Gajinder Singh
Under Secretary
Ministry of Home Affairs

M.R.T.
17/5

Ref. Home Ministry is on previous page.

vat slip 1/

The Dissentient Report is placed below. The
Ministry of Home Affairs may kindly remove it for
forward transmission.

H.M.A.
20.5.57

M. V. Swayambar
20.5.57

R Ministry of Home Affairs. (Shri Gajinder Singh
U.S.)

u239/51005
24/5.57
Ministry of Home Affairs / 24/28/1957 / 56 dt 20/5/57

The I.B. may ~~remove~~ remove their copy of
the DISSIDENT REPORT.

Concordance
21.5.57

Gajinder Singh
Under Secretary
Ministry of Home Affairs

Copy of the Dissentient Report
Intelligence Bureau (Shri N.K. Ray)

M.H.A. u/o No. 4239/51005 dt 22/5/57

D.Y. No. 3214/D
dt 23-5-57

Intelligence Bureau
Ministry of Home Affairs.

Removed; thanks.

nday
27/5/57

(N.K. Ray)

Joint Deputy Director.

28 MAY 1957

u548/51005
25/5.

M.H.A. (Shri Gajinder Singh)
D.I.B. U.O. No. 31/06/56, dt.

- 8 -

Returned from Mrs. of Ex. Affairs.

(against)

D. 2012-FA[57]
M 29/5
P 20/5
W 15/5
20/5
M.H.A. no. 4548(57) falls on 29/5/57
Mrs. of Ex. Affairs (Shri D.R. Phadani)

28.5.57
Ministry of Home Affairs

Ministry of External Affairs

Record B' P.M.
Date
20.5.57 ✓

Min. Ex. & N.O.S.
MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS.
(EA SECTION)

- (1) Page 188 - Report by the Counter Intelligence Corps., G.H.Q. AFPAC dated 29.9.45.
- (2) 190 - Top Secret Report dated 29.9.45 of the Combined British and American Intelligence Officers.
- ✓ (3) 191 - Secret Headquarters Main File 10 Misc. I.N.A., 273 I.N.A.
- (4) 193 - To O.C.Kikan, from Chief of Staff Southern Army, Staff II Signal 66, 20th Aug. Top Secret -
- (5) 194 - Extract from Allied Land Forces S.E.A., No.57 for week ending 2 November 1945.
- ✓ (6) 195 - Extract from Top Secret letter No.SLO/CS/1 dated 1.3.46 from C. I.C.B., to A.D.(J).
- (7) 196 - No.C-5, Intelligence Bureau, (H.D.), New Delhi 3, Dated the 19 Feb. 46, Secret.
- (8) 212 - Allied Secret Report No.10/Misc/I.N.A.

Correspondence



SHRI N. SAHGAL ICS,
JOINT SECRETARY.

SECRET

D.O. No. 18489/56-Part (1)

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS.

NEW DELHI-2,

the 22nd December 1956.

(1)

Dear Shri Dutt,

I enclose a copy of the Director, Intelligence Bureau, U.O. No. 31/D.G/56, dated the 20th December 1956, along with the Dissentient Report by Shri Suresh Chandra Bose, for such action as you consider necessary. We may kindly be informed of your decision in due course.

Not actd.

Durgish
PSGFS

24.12.56

Yours sincerely,

N. SAHGAL

(N. SAHGAL)

S. S. (E) 9231 SS (E)
Shri S. Dutt ICS,
Foreign Secretary,
Ministry of E.A.,
New Delhi.

Dutt
24/12

26/XII

(2)

SECRET

INTELLIGENCE BUREAU
(MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS)

Will the Ministry of Home Affairs kindly refer to this Bureau's u.o. No. 31/D.G/56, dated 17.8.56 regarding Top Secret documents of the Govt. of India made available to the Chairman of the Netaji Enquiry Committee ?

Enclosed herewith is a copy of the book entitled "Dissentient Report" by Suresh Chandra Bose. It would be observed that some of the photographs (Appendix R, Q and S) published in the book are similar to those which were sent by us to the Netaji Enquiry Committee. Similarly, some extracts from secret reports find place in the book vide pages 188-200 of the book. This amounts to unauthorised publication of secret official documents.

A | It is for consideration of the Ministry of Home Affairs whether any action is to be taken against the author and publisher of the report.

Sd

DEPUTY DIRECTOR

MHA (Shri A.V. PAI)
DIB U.O. No. 31/D.G/56, dated 20 Dec. 1956.

Secret -

No. 9231 JS(E)

(3)

Forwarded

(2)

24th December 1956.

SWD (1)

My dear Sahgal,

This is to acknowledge your
D.O. No. 10489/56-Poll(1) dated 22nd
December 1956 addressed to the Foreign
Secretary, enclosing a copy of the DIB
U.O. No. 31/D.G/56 dated 20-12-1956 and
a copy of the "Dissentient Report" of
Shri Suresh Chandra Bose.

2. I am having the matter examined
and shall let you know the decision in
due course.

Yours sincerely,

B.K. Acharya

(B.K. Acharya)

Shri N. Sahgal, I.C.S.,
Joint Secretary,
Ministry of Home Affairs,
NEW DELHI.

Shri Raj Kumar, I.A.S. n. 599-EA/52 SECRET.
Deputy Secretary. D.O. No. 18489/56-Poll(I)



GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS.

New Delhi-2

2nd February, 1957.

Dear Shri Acharya,

4(2)

Please refer to your d.o. letter No. 9231 JS(E) dated the 24th December 1956 to Shri Sahgal, regarding the "Dissentient Report" by Shri Suresh Chandra Bose. We shall be grateful to be informed if you are now in a position to let us know the decision taken in the matter.

I think P.S. has already indicated that no action need be taken. Pl. confirm with your sincerely,
Shri B.K. Acharya, I.O.S., Tel. No. 31256
Joint Secretary,
Ministry of External Affairs
NEW DELHI.

(Raj Kumar)

5(2) | 28(E) | DS(E) | File submitted | T(E) | P(E) | P(E) | ✓

(4)

D.O.W. D. 599 EA/57

5

6th February 1957.

7

Dear Shri Raj Kumar,

S.Mo(3)

S 1/103

Kindly refer to your D.O. letter No.18489/56-Poll(I) of the 2nd February to Shri Acharya regarding the "Dissident Report" by Shri Suresh Chandra Bose.

The documents reproduced in this report belong to Army Headquarters. We are, therefore, forwarding our file to the Defence Ministry. Thereafter, it may also be expedient to consult Deputy Minister for Transport as to whether any action should be initiated for the unauthorised publication of secret official documents. Prima facie, the Foreign Secretary is of the view that it would be expedient to let this matter rest rather than take the risk of reviving controversy and public interest on the subject of the death of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose. We will, however, write to you again in due course.

Yours sincerely,

(J. S. Mehta)

JSM

Shri Raj Kumar,
Deputy Secretary,
Ministry of Home Affairs,
New Delhi.

Forwarded P.M. 15/2
R.M.
7/2

P.M. 6/2
6/2
7/2

Ministry of External Affairs

R & W Unit

File No. 24(28)FEA/56...

S1. 'Borrower's Dy. No.' To be put' Date of 'To be 'Retur! Signa-
No. Name, desig- & 'up with ' issue 'returned' ned 'ture
nation, Sec/ 'date 'file No./' 'on or 'on 'of
Div. ' 'Dy. No. ' before ' 'R.S.

1-Shri H.A.Amin. S/1092/73 4551/5/72 129 1672/11/73 *Abu*
S.O (EAD) 12-9-73. JA 122 73. 73 73

N.B. (1) File should be returned in tact.

- (2) It will be the personal responsibility of the borro-
wer to return the file within the specified date.
- (3) In case the file can not be returned within the
specified date, a fresh requisition slip may be sent
with the request to extend the date by another
3 months.

~~55~~ 640/66 S/1092
73

02-17-21-A